MOBBING AND ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT: A CASE STUDY OF BANKING SECTOR IN PESHAWAR

Aminullah Khan¹ and Dr. Shabbir Haider²

Abstract

Mobbing is a group activity in which few people are collectively exercises negative behaviors against a single individual to pressurized and enforced to bring him/her in an unsecure position and which ultimately resulted in to drag out of the organization. Current study addresses this behavior by collecting the data questionnaire survey from the banking sector of Peshawar (KPK). Questionnaires were distributed among the 90 employees of the banks with the response rate of 63.3%. Main finding of the study suggest that mobbing and organizational commitment have significant relationship. The study findings also suggest that affective commitment has highly significant association, while intension to leave the organization is weak and positively correlated to mobbing in the workplace.

Key Words: Mobbing, Organizational Commitment, Peshawar, KPK

1. Introduction

Mobbing is a group activity in which few people are collectively exercises negative behaviors against a single individual to pressurized and enforced to bring him/her in an unsecure position and which ultimately resulted in to drag out of the organization. Mobbing has a subjective nature and very difficult to understand. As Leymann (1990), stated that mobbing is a hidden and complicated concept, and anybody can suffer from it (Yildrim & Yildrim, 2007).

Literature review revealed that with increasing interest of researchers in workplace bullying in the last few years (Einarsen, Raknes, & Matthiesen, 1994; Leymann, 1990), the phenomenon has been studied under various terms, such as mobbing (Leymann, 1996),

¹ MS Scholar, COMSAT Institute of Information and Technology, Attock Campus. Correspondent Author, amin.u.khan@gmail.com

² Assistant Professor, COMSAT Institute of Information and Technology, Attock Campus

workplace bullying (Hoel, Cooper, & Faragher, 2001, emotional abuse (Keashly, 1998), victimization (Einarsen & Raknes, 1997), and psychological terror (Leymann, 1990). harassment (Brodsky 1976), bullying (Adams 1992), work abuse (Bassmann 1992), victimization (Olweus 1994), and workplace aggression' (Baron and Neuman 1996).

Organizational Commitment is the employee's emotional and psychological attachment to their respective organization. A very comprehensive model has been developed by Meyer and Allen (1997) to assess the commitment of the employees. The model is composed of Affective Commitment, Continuance Commitment and Normative Commitment. This study is important in the sense that there is lack of knowledge and high workload among the employees in the banking sector, which enrich the importance of mobbing and organizational commitment in the workplace.

Research so far done in this field found inconclusive relationship between mobbing and organizational commitment. This current study also attempted to find out the relationship between the two in case of banking sectors in Peshawar district. Also the overall commitment of the employees will also be analyzed in this study. The Objectives of the Study are;

- To assess the relationship between mobbing and organizational commitment.
- To assess the magnitude of mobbing that affects the commitment of employees.
- To assess whether intentions of the employees to leave the organization is negatively affected by mobbing or not?

This study will be conducted under the following hypotheses;

 H_1 : There is a positive relationship between mobbing and organizational commitment

 H_2 : There is negative relationship between mobbing in the workplace and affective commitment

 H_3 : There is positive relationship between mobbing in the workplace and intensions to leave the organization

2. Literature Review

Since 1990 mobbing has been widely research especially in European countries. These researchers look differently to the phenomenon of mobbing thus define and measure it differently. As

every country is different from the other with respect to its culture, values and history thus mobbing also is seen slightly differently in one country from the other. Below are some studies that have been conducted on analyzing the mobbing behavior at various levels.

Leymann (1992) take the interview of 2428 workers and found that 3.5 percent workers were exposed to mobbing. Taking the limit of the 30 years of a particular worker as an employee, it is found that in such case 25 percent mobbing is found. Amongst them 55 percent a worker that has been mobbed were men while the remaining were women. His study found that 40 percent workers were mobbed by 2 to 4 people while 1/3 was mobbed by one. Study further concludes that out of the entire workplace about 6.5 percent people that were mobbed were belonged to educational institutions.

In Australia the extent of mobbing was found higher than the Scandavian countries. Niedl conducted his study in 1996 and found that in Australia the level the range of mobbing in Australian organization is in between 7 percent to 27 percent.

In United Kingdom the phenomenon of mobbing has been studied in late 1990s. Quine (1999) found that in a questionnaire based survey conducted in England in the department of National Health Service Community, 38 percent of the employees were confront with mobbing. In an other survey, conducted by Stanford University Business School (SUBS), it is found that 53 percent participants were exposed to mobbing while the 78 percent said that they witnessed the others that have been confronted with mobbing, (Andrea Adams Trust, 2010).

Hole and Cooper (2000) conduct the study taking 5000 employees of 70 different organizations. They found that 28 percent women and 22 percent men were exposed to mobbing in the last five years. Study further found that the younger people were more exposed to mobbing as compare to older employees. Quite different results were found in Norway where the aged people were found more exposed than the younger employees to the mobbing.

In Denmark through empirical study Mikkelsen and Einarsen (2001) found that the level of mobbing is low while in reality they witness a high degree of mobbing so they conclude that the empirical findings does not capture the true picture of the story.

Martino (2002) conduct the survey with the help of various international organization (ILO, ICN, WHO) and found that in Bulgaria there is 30.9 percent mobbing at various workplaces, South Africa have 20 percent, Lebanon have 22 percent, Thailand percent in Brazil percent mobbing is found in various workplaces.

Matthiesen and Einarsen (2007) are of the view that in every workplace in Scandavian countries about 3 percent to 4 percent people are exposed to mobbing.

Sa and Fleming (2008) conduct their study for Portugal and found that 13 percent nurses are exposed to mobbing. According to these authors high degree of mobbing was found in those areas where there was work degradation, the load of work that were unmanageable and through giving unlikable work tasks. In their study they found that because of being mobbed the 1/3 nurses showed the intention to quit the job. Half of the nurses found it difficult to sleep, 43 percent nurses demoralized and 71 percent has bad tempered.

Celik and Peker (2010), "Mobbing perceptions of high school teachers" collected the sample from the high school teachers who worked at Istanbul, Turkey. They attempted to find out the victim teachers of mobbing at high school. Collecting the data through questionnaire and used t-test, ANOVA and Kruskal-Wallis tests for the analysis of data. They found that various factors has significant variation on mobbing like age, experience, career and status etc. and it was concluded that mobbing is found in the form of rumoring and non-appreciation and criticism.

Yuksel and Tuncsiper (2011), "The Relationship between Mobbing and Organizational Commitment in Workplace" interviewed 120 participants and they found that in total of these 120 only 5 confront with intense form of mobbing, 20 participants faced mid level mobbing and rest of 95 participants do not confront with such a situation that can be called mobbing.

Gok (2011) "Prevalence and types of Mobbing Behavior: A research on Banking employees" conducted the study in Istanbul, Turkey so that to find out mobbing behavior. A total of 384 participants were interviewed. They conclude that 32 percent people were mobbed in their whole working life. 16 percent faced the mobbing behavior since the last year

Cheraghi and Piskin (2011), "A comparison of peer bullying among high school students in Iran and Turkey" conduct their study to analyze the bullying behavior in Iran and Turkey. 874 students were interviewed from Iran and 859 students were interviewed from Turkey. They conclude that the Iranian students were more exposed to bullying comparing with the Turkish students. In their own, the Turkish students were more bullied. The interesting findings of that study were that they found that males were more bullied than the females. The Turkish females were the least exposed than the Iranian females.

Celep and Eminoglu (2012), Primary school teacher's experience with mobbing and teacher's self-efficacy perceptions" found that mobbing by the colleagues and superiors were of high significance. The mobbing from administrative and colleagues sides affect competency of the teachers, it also affects the attitude and behaviour. Concluding the findings of their study it can be said that mobbing has negative impacts on the teacher efficiency. The teachers attach with a particular subject were more exposed to mobbing comparing with the class teachers, teachers having the age I between 23 to 32 were more confront with mobbing behavior from their heads as compared to the those having the age in between 33 years to 42 years.

Aydin Aydan *et al.*, (2012), "Behaviors perceived as mobbing by the instructors assigned in special education institutions" attempted to find out the mobbing behavior in educational institution. They interviewed the 280 instructors. They conclude that mostly managers exhibit the mobbing behavior especially in the managers that have the age in between the range of 23 to 35. With the increase of the age the mobbing behavior were decreased significantly, e.g. amongst the age of 23 to 25 this behavior were found to be 67 percent while in the age between 36 to 48 the mobbing was found to be 23 percent. In the age group of 49 and above the mobbing behavior were decreased up to appreciable extent and it was found that in this group the mobbing behavior was 9.6 percent.

3. Methodology

A questionnaire based survey was applied to collect the relevant information and data from the employees of banks in Peshawar in order to test the relationship between mobbing and OC in the workplace and to assess the mobbing in relation to employees organizational commitment

The selected banks were visited to get the information. A survey was conducted among the four banks of Peshawar i.e. ABL, UBL, HBL and NBP. The participants of this study include those employees whom are working in the banks of Peshawar. Questionnaires were distributed among the 90 employees and of which only 57 were handed back with a response rate of 63.3 percent.

A questionnaire was composed of three sections. The first section of the questionnaire was regarding the demographic information of the respondents. The second part was about mobbing behaviors which was measured by verbal attacks, social isolation and physical attacks including five items for each of the mobbing subvariables. While the third section of the questionnaire was related to OC. The commitment of employee's was measured through four variables namely; affective commitment, continuance commitment, normative commitment and intension of the employee to leave the organization (ILO). There were five items for each of the variable of the OC with a total of twenty items to assess OC of the employee.

Mobbing was determined by 15 negative behaviors developed by Leymann, (1996) and interpreted by Demigril, (2008). Mobbing was measured by a 5 point Likert scale;

- 1- Strongly Disagree,
- 2- Disagree,
- 3- Neutral,
- 4- Agree and
- 5- Strongly Agree.

Organizational Commitment (OC) has been measured by 20 item scales. The OC model was developed by Meyer and Allen (1997) and interpreted by (Glissmer, Bishop, Fass; Commeiras and Fournier, 2001). A 5 point Likert scale was used to measured the commitment of employee's, ranging from 1= Strongly Disagree to 5= Strongly Agree discussed above.

After having the questionnaire constructed, data gathered from the employees of the banks, the data is analyzed by using SPSS 16.00 version. For demographic observations descriptive statistics was applied such as frequencies and percentages. Further for the analyses of the hypotheses regression analysis was used which is a powerful and flexible procedure for the analysis of associative relationship between dependent variables and independent variables (Malhotra, 2003).

Analyzing the main relationship between mobbing and organizational commitment correlation was applied to check whether there prevails any significant relationship between them or not.

4. Results and Finding

This section of chapter displays the findings of the study and discusses the results. The findings of the study collected and interpreted under the following headings and sought answer for the questions of the research studied.

4.1 Reliability of Mobbing and Organizational Commitment Table No. 1: Reliability Analysis

Sub Scale	No. of Statements	Cronbach Alfa Co- efficient (α)		
VA	5	0.93		
SI	5	0.92		
PA	5	0.91		
AC	5	0.72		
CC	5	0.73		
NC	5	0.84		
ILO	5	0.72		

VA: Verbal Attacks; SI: Social Isolation; PA: Physical Attacks; AC: Affective Commitment; CC: Continuance Commitment; NC: Normative Commitment; ILO: Intentions to Leave Organization

In the reliability analysis, each variable's alpha co-efficient is observed. This table shows the reliability of the variables of mobbing and OC. It is been seen that the values of reliabilities ranges between .72-.93. This displays that these variables are highly reliable. There were 5 statements for each variable. The reliability of the mobbing sub scale are (VA= .93, SI= .92, PA= .91) and for the Organizational Commitment sub scale there reliability are (AC= .72, CC= .73, NC= .84 & LO= .72).

4.2 Findings about the Participant's Demographic Results

To determine the demographic features like gender, age and qualification, frequency analysis is applied and following findings are attained. This table 2 displays the results regarding the demographic information of the respondents and the results shows that the percentage of male employees participated in the survey is 82.5% and 17.5% are female employees. The respondent's age results show that

the dominant part of the respondents 36.8% is in the age group of 29-36 year old. Further the participants having master degree contributed to the survey with 82.5%.

Table No. 2: Frequency and Percentage Dispersion of employees Demographic Factor

Demographic Factor						
Demographic	Variables	Frequenc y	Percentag e			
Gender	Male	47	82.5			
	Female	10	17.5			
Age	21-28	20	35.1			
	29-36	21	36.8			
	37-44		15.8			
45-52 53-60		5	8.8			
		2	3.5			
Qualificatio n	Bachelo r	9	15.8			
	Master	47	82.5			
Others		1	1.8			

4.3 Correlations between mobbing and organizational commitment of the employees

The purpose of this section of the study is to find if there are any changes caused by mobbing behavior to the commitment. In order to find out this relationship, correlation analysis has been applied and the results are shown in Table. This table shows that there is moderate relationship between mobbing and organization commitment where (r=-.53). The probability suggests that the correlation between two variables is highly significant. More statistically speaking R² is 0.28, which means that organizational commitment is 28% affected by mobbing occur inside the banking sector.

Table 3: Correlation between Mobbing and OC determinants

Variables	Mean	St. Dev	Mobbing	ос	AC	сс	NC	LO
Mobbing	2.49	1.25	1					
OC	3.10	.67	536**	1				
AC	3.47	.83	705**	.800**	1			
CC	2.99	.87	317**	.836**	.551**	1		
NC	3.20	.99	718**	.839**	.714**	.591**	1	
LO	2.75	.82	.176	.540**	.142	.385**	.169	1

Note: **. *p*<0.01 significance levels (2-tailed). *.*p*<0.05 significance levels (2-tailed)

Table 3 also explains the OC sub variables association with mobbing and shows that mobbing carried out by the executives against employees affective commitment is (r=-.705, p<.000), this means that mobbing have strong impact on the affective commitment of the employees. Normative commitment (r=-.718, p=.000) has inverse and highly significant association with mobbing in the workplace. Similarly Continuance commitment of the employees is (r=-.317, p<.000) has moderate relationship with mobbing and the impact is negative. Intensions to leave the organizations has positive but insignificant relationship with mobbing (r=.176, p<.019).

4.4: Regression Analysis

Table No. 4: Mobbing effects on AC

Model	\mathbb{R}^2	F-	Bet	Al
		statistics	a	pha
Mobbing	0.29	222.16	=	0.0
Modding	0.29	222.10	0.285	00

Dependent Variable: Organizational Commitment

To assess that there is negative relationship between mobbing an OC (H_1) . We computed the regression analysis in which mobbing serve as the independent variable and OC was used as dependent variable. Results confirm that there is significant association between the two variables $(F=22.16, p=0.000, R^2=0.29)$. Being negative, the Beta value suggests that there is negative/inverse relationship between the mobbing and OC. It means organizational commitment of the

employees is influenced by 29% due to mobbing from the executives. This result is supported by the findings of Pelit and Kilic, (2012).

The effects of mobbing for the employees are caused due to low self-confidence of the employees, work stress, high absenteeism, low morale and the overall performance of the organization is negatively affected by these destructive behaviors. The management needs to provide training related to the employees regarding organizational ethics and people skills, such as conflict management, negotiation and workplace civility. These training will help in enhancing the commitment of the employees. The management also needs to improve the communication link, so that all the employees participated in decision making and shared the desired organizational values. This will help in enhancing employee's citizenship. The management needs to be unbiased and flexible to minimize the narrow thinking of the employee's.

Table No. 5: Mobbing effects on AC

Model	R-Square	F-Statistics	beta	Alpha
Mobbing	0.49	54.5	-0.47	0.000

Dependent Variable: Affective Commitment

To assess that there is positive relationship between mobbing in the workplace and AC (H_2) , a regression analysis is conducted. The result shows that there R^2 value is greater than zero which indicate that there is highly significant association the two variables $(F=54.5, p=0.000, R^2=0.49)$. As the value of Beta is negative, confirms the inverse relationship between mobbing and affective commitment. This means that mobbing causes 49% affective commitment the employee's in the workplace. The result of the study is supported by the findings of (Yuksel and Tuncsiper, 2011; Erturiten, Cemaleilar and Aycan, 2012).

Mobbing hurts badly the affective commitment of employees. The management needs to support the emotional belongingness of the victim by introducing work friendly environment. The suggestion for the management to improve the affective commitment of the employee's, is to create friendly working condition (e.g. fairness, feedback and involvement in decision making).

Table No. 6: Mobbing and intentions to Leave Organization

Model	\mathbb{R}^2	F-statistics	Beta	Alpha
Mobbing	0.036	5.77	0.129	0.000

Dependent Variable: Intentions to leave Organization

To assess that there is positive relationship between mobbing and intentions to leave the organization (H₃), a regression analysis is run. The results shows that there is positive and weak association between mobbing and intention to leave the organization (F= 1.76 p=.000<0.05, R-square= 0.031). As the value of beta is positive which confirm that there is positive impact but relationship is week. This result is supported by the findings of (Yuksel, 2011; Namie and Namie, 2009). If mobbing is happening there in the organization, still these employees cannot leave their respective organization because of the high level of unemployment in Pakistan.

5. Conclusion, Limitations and Recommendation

Mobbing has destructive behaviors in its domain which demoralize and affect the commitment of the employees. OC is considered is one of the sources of competition for the organization. In view of such quickly changing business environment, organizations should apply better attempt to improve their skills and abilities, and it must not be forgotten that the success and competing power of the organization depend on committed, highly motivated, satisfied and innovative workforce.

In light of the findings of this study as mobbing has significant relationship with employee's organizational commitment in the workplace. The affective and commitment has also been in highly significant association to mobbing while the intensions of employees to leave organization has weak relationship. The reason behind this weak relationship is the intense economic slumps and unemployment in the country. It is suggested to the executives that as mobbing demoralize the mobber and ultimately affect the commitment which do not favor a particular organization therefore they should resolve this issue seriously. This study will provide following suggestions to the management of the banking sector.

Management should promote the commitment of their employees by improving supervision styles. Employees that are treated well, ultimately build up constructive feelings towards management and the organization. The management can enhance the commitment of the employees by engaging employees in decision making process, providing better working condition and providing flexible working hours and paying fairly, encouraging employees to use their own skills and abilities help them to have a sense of self-pride, a sense of competence and a sense of self confidence that increases job satisfaction and also to promote clear communication link which will lead to discourage narrow thinking of the executive, and will increase the overall commitment of the employee. Employees having a high job satisfaction are expected to be committed to the organizations.

The sample size of the study was not sufficient to draw more concrete results but if it enlarge and extended to more sectors then the results will display the true picture. The study was conducted in the male dominant society and a single cultural setting, which influenced the study findings. It needs to be studied in more diverse and multicultural organizational surroundings where there are equal job opportunities. This will put more light on the mobbing behaviors in Pakistan. Lack of knowledge and interest of the respondents in the mobbing phenomenon has been witnessed during the survey. This issue needs to be addressed in those organizations where the respondents are highly educated and skillful then this issue will be clearly identified and elaborated.

REFERENCES

- Adams, A (1992) "Bullying at work: How to confront and overcome it". London: Virago.
- Andrea Adams Trust. (www.andreaadamstrust.org)
- Aydan, A. Mustafa, O, and Tuna, S. (2012) "Behaviors perceived as mobbing by the instructors assigned in special education institutions", Journal of Social and Behavioral Sciences Vol.46, pp. 4858 4863
- Brodsky, C.M (1976) "The Harassed Worker" Toronto: Lexington Books; DC Heath and Company.
- Bassman E. S (1992) "Abuse in the Workplace: Management Remedies and Bottom Line Impact". Quorum Books, Westport LT.
- Baron, R. A., & Neuman, J. H (1996) "Workplace violence and workplace aggression: Evidence on their relative frequency and potential causes". Aggressive Behaviour, Vol. 22, pp. 161–173.
- Cheraghi, A. and Piskin, M. (2011) "A comparison of peer bullying among high school students in Iran and Turkey" Journal of Social and Behavioral Sciences, Vol. 15. pp. 2510–2520
- Celep, c. & Eminoglu, E. (2012), "Primary school teacher's experience with mobbing and teacher's self-efficacy perceptions" Journal of Social and Behavioral Sciences, Vol No. 46, pp. 4761 4774
- Celik, S. & Peker, S. (2010), "Mobbing perceptions of high school teacher" Journal of Social and Behavioral Sciences Vol. 9, pp. 1617–1623
- Di Martino, V. (2002) "Workplace violence in the health sector country case studies". ILO/ICN/WHO/PSI Joint Program on workplace violence in health sector, Geneva.
- Einarsen, S., Raknes, B. I., & Matthiesen, S. B. (1994) "Bullying and Harassment at Work and Their Relationship to Work Environment Quality". European Work and Organizational Psychologist, Vol. 4 (4), pp. 381-401.
- Ertureten, A, Cemalcilar, Z & Aycan, Z. () "The Relationship of Downward Mobbing with Leadership Styleand Organizational Attitudes", Journal of Business Ethics.
- Einerson, S. (2000). Harassment and bullying at work: A review of the Scandinavian approach. Aggression and Violent Behavior, 5(4), 379-400.
- Gul, H, Ince, M. & Ozcan, N. (2011) "The Relationship between Workplace Mobbing and Bourn Out Among Academics at a

- Turkey University", Research Journal of International Studies, Vol. 18(Jan, 2011)
- Gok, S. (2011), "Prevalence and types of mobbing behavior: A research on banking employees". International Journal of Human Sciences, Vol. 8(1), pp. 318-334
- Hoel, H. & Cooper, C (2000) "Destructive Conflict and Bullying at Work". Manchester: School of Management, UMIST
- Keashly, L. (1998) "Emotional abuse in the workplace: Conceptual and empirical issues". Journal of Emotional Abuse, Vol. 1, pp. 85–117.
- Leymann, H (1996) "The Content and Development of Mobbing at Work". European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology, Vol.5 (2), pp. 165-184
- Leymann, H (1990) "Mobbing and psychological terror at workplaces", Violence and Victims, Vol. 5, pp. 119–126.
- Malhorta, N. K & Birks David F (2003) "Marketing research". London: Practice Hall
- Meyer, J., & Allen, N. (1997). Commitment in the workplace. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- Mikkelsen, E., & Einarsen, S (2001) "Relationships between exposure to bullying at work and psychological and psychosomatic health complaints: The role of state negative affectivity and generalized self-efficacy". Scandinavian Journal of Psychology, Vol. 43(5), pp. 397–405
- Matthiesen, S. B., & Einarsen, S (2007) "Perpetrators and Targets of Bullying at Work: Role Stress and Individual Differences". Violence and Victims, Vol. 2 (6), pp. 735-750.
- Niedl (1996) "Mobbing and wellbeing". European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology, Vol. 5, pp. 239–249.
- Neuman, J. H., & Baron, R. A (2003) "Social antecedents of bullying: victims and Perpetrators". In S. Einarsen, H. Hoel, D. Zapf, & C. L. Cooper, Bullying and Emotional Abuse in the Workplace (pp. 185-202). London: Taylor & Francis.
- Namie G & Namie R (2003) "The bully at work: what you can do to stop the hurt and reclaim your dignity on the job". Naperville, IL: Sourcebooks.
- Olweus, D. (1993). Bullying at School: What We Know and What We Can D? Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Pelit, E & Kılıc, I. (2012) "The Relationship between Mobbing and Organizational Commitment: An Application on City and Resort Hotels", Journal of Business Research-Turk, Vol. 4/2 (2012) 122-140

- Quine L (1999) "Workplace bullying in NHS community trust: staff questionnaire survey". Business & Management Journal, Vol. 318, pp. 228–232.
- Rayner, C., Hoel, H., & Cooper, C. L (2002) "Workplace Bullying": What we know, Who to blame and what can we do? London: Taylor & Francis.
- Sa, L., & Fleming, M (2008) "Bullying, burnout and mental health among Portuguese nurses". Issues in Mental Health Nursing, Vol. 29, pp. 411-426.
- Thylefors, I (1987) "Syndbockar (scapegoats), natur og kultur". Stockholm.
- Wilson, C (1991) "US businesses suffer from workplace trauma". Personnel Journal, pp. 47-50
- Westhues, K. (2002). At the mercy of the mob. Canada's Occupational Health & Safety Magazine, 18, 30-36.
- Yildirim, A & Yildirim, D, (2007) "Mobbing in the Workplace by Peers and Managers: Mobbing Experienced by Nurses Working in Healthcare Facilities in Turkey and its Effect on Nurses", Journal of Clinical Nursing, Vol. 16, pp. 1444-1453.
- Yuksel, M & Tuncsiper, B, (2011) "the Relationship between Mobbing and Organizational Commitment in the Workplace". International review of Management and marketing, Vol. 1, No. 3, 2011, pp. 54-64
- Yamada, D.C. (2004). Crafting a legislative response to workplace bullying. Employee Rights and Employment Policy Journal, 8, 475-521.
- Zapf, D, Knorz, C, & Kulla, M, (1996) "On the relationship between mobbing factors, and job content, social work environment, and health outcomes". European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology, Vol. (5), pp. 215-237.